### **Annex 5- Site Comparison**

There are 1,092 Properties listed on the World Heritage List. The majority are Cultural (845), approximately one fifth are Natural (209) and just 38 are mixed.

The UK has 26 Cultural World Heritage Sites. Two of these are in British Overseas Territories, Gibraltar's Gorham's Cave inscribed in 2016 criteria (iii) and the Historic Town of St George and Related Fortifications, Bermuda (2000) criteria (iv). The UK has 4 Natural Sites of which two are British Overseas Territories: Gough and Inaccessible Islands, inscribed 1995 and extended 2004 criteria (vii) (x) and Henderson Island, Pitcairn Group (1988) criteria (vii) (x). The UK has just one Mixed bid, St Kilda (1986, with extensions 2004 and 2005).

### **Natural Sites**

### Kiribati

Site: Phoenix Islands Protected Area

**Indicators:** (vii) (ix)

### Comments (how OU identified, impact assessments, data / evidence:

The Phoenix Island Protected Area (PIPA) is a 408,250 sq.km expanse of marine and terrestrial habitats in the Southern Pacific Ocean. The property encompasses the Phoenix Island Group, one of three island groups in Kiribati, and is the largest designated Marine Protected Area in the world. PIPA conserves one of the world's largest intact oceanic coral archipelago ecosystems, together with 14 known underwater sea mounts (presumed to be extinct volcanoes) and other deep-sea habitats. The area contains approximately 800 known species of fauna, including about 200 coral species, 500 fish species, 18 marine mammals and 44 bird species. The structure and functioning of PIPA's ecosystems illustrates its pristine nature and importance as a migration route and reservoir. This is the first site in Kiribati to be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

**Sources:** https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1325/

# Seychelles

Site: Vallée de Mai Nature Reserve

Indicators: (vii), (viii), (ix), (x)

## Comments (how OU identified, impact assessments, data / evidence:

Date of inscription: 1983. In the heart of the small island of Praslin, the reserve has the vestiges of a natural palm forest preserved in almost its original state. The famous coco de mer, from a palm-tree once believed to grow in the depths of the sea, is the largest seed in the plant kingdom. Located on the granitic island of Praslin, the Vallée de Mai is a 19.5 ha area of palm forest which remains largely unchanged since prehistoric times. Dominating the landscape is the world's largest population of endemic coco-de-mer, a flagship species of global significance as the bearer of the largest seed in the plant kingdom. The forest is also home to five other endemic palms and many endemic fauna species. The property is a scenically attractive area with a distinctive natural beauty 19.5 ha (48 acres)

#### Sources:

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/261/

Reunion Island

Site: Pitons, cirques and remparts

Indicators: (viii) (x)

# Comments (how OU identified, impact assessments, data / evidence:

Date of inscription: 2010

The Pitons, cirques and remparts of Reunion Island site coincides with the core zone of La Réunion National Park. The property covers more than 100,000 ha or 40 % of La Réunion, an island comprising two adjoining volcanic massifs located in the south-west of the Indian Ocean. Dominated by two towering volcanic peaks, massive walls and three cliff-rimmed cirques, the property includes a great variety of rugged terrain and impressive escarpments, forested gorges and basins creating a visually striking landscape. It is the natural habitat for a wide diversity of plants, presenting a high level of endemism. There are subtropical rainforests, cloud forests and heaths creating a remarkable and visually appealing mosaic of ecosystems and landscape features.

Property size 105,838 ha. Buffer zone 11,729 ha.

#### Sources:

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1317/

### **Ecuador**

Site: Galapagos Island

Indicators: (vii)(viii)(ix)(x)

# Comments (how OU identified, impact assessments, data / evidence:

Date of inscription: 1978, 2001

Situated in the Pacific Ocean some 1,000 km from the South American continent, these 19 islands and the surrounding marine reserve have been called a unique 'living museum and showcase of evolution'. Located at the confluence of three ocean currents, the Galápagos are a 'melting pot' of marine species. Ongoing seismic and volcanic activity reflects the processes that formed the islands. These processes, together with the extreme isolation of the islands, led to the development of unusual animal life – such as the land iguana, the giant tortoise and the many types of finch – that inspired Charles Darwin's theory of evolution by natural selection following his visit in 1835.

Other protections: Biosphere reserve <a href="http://www.unesco.org/mabdb/br/brdir/directory/biores.asp?code=ECU+01&mode=all">http://www.unesco.org/mabdb/br/brdir/directory/biores.asp?code=ECU+01&mode=all</a> Ramsar <a href="http://rsis.ramsar.org/ris/1202?language=en">http://rsis.ramsar.org/ris/1202?language=en</a>

### **Sources:**

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1 https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1/documents/

# United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland

Site: Henderson Island, Pitcairn Group

**Indicators:** (vii) (x)

# Comments (how OU identified, impact assessments, data / evidence:

Date of inscription: 1988

Henderson Island, which lies in the eastern South Pacific, is one of the few atolls in the world whose ecology has been practically untouched by a human presence. Its isolated location provides the ideal context for studying the dynamics of insular evolution and natural selection. It is particularly notable for the 10 plants and four land birds that are endemic to the island

Property size 3,700 ha

International donation 75%; Government 25% Minor increase Positive: conservation, research and monitoring, management effectiveness, recognition, lobbying, institutional coordination

No impact: Political support for conservation, legal/policy framework

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/487

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/487/documents/

## United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland

Site: Gough and Inaccessible Islands

Indicators: (vii) (x)

## Comments (how OU identified, impact assessments, data / evidence:

Date of inscription: 1995, 2004

The site, located in the south Atlantic, is one of the least-disrupted island and marine ecosystems in the cool temperate zone. The spectacular cliffs of Gough and Inaccessible Islands, towering above the ocean, are free of introduced mammals and home to one of the world's largest colonies of sea birds. Gough Island is home to two endemic species of land birds, the gallinule and the Gough rowettie, as well as to 12 endemic species of plants, while Inaccessible Island boasts two birds, eight plants and at least 10 invertebrates endemic to the island.

 $Other\ protections:\ Ramsar:\ Gough\ Island\ \underline{http://rsis.ramsar.org/ris/1869?language=en}\ Inaccessible\ Island\ \underline{http://rsis.ramsar.org/ris/1869?langu$ 

Very positive: conservation

Costs for conservation relative to funding source: International donations 50%; Government 50%

Trend in annual visitation: NA

Recognised impacts of WHS: Positive: research and monitoring; management effectiveness, recognition, funding for the property

No impact: political support for conservation

Sources: <a href="https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/740">https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/740</a>

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/740/documents/

RSPB would be key advisors in respect to further information

Yemen

Site: Socotra Archipelago

Indicators: (x)

Date of inscription: 2008

Sources:

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1263

St Lucia

Site: Pitons Management Area, St Lucia

Indicators: (vii)(viii)

Date of inscription: 2004

Land and sea <a href="https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1161">https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1161</a>

Costa Rica

Site: Cocos Island National Park

(ix)(x)

Comments (how OU identified, impact assessments, data / evidence:

Date of inscription: 1997 & 2002

Land and sea humid tropical forest and marine tropical waters

Sources: https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/820

Lord Howe Island Group, Australia

Indicators: (vii)(x)

Date of inscription 1982

### Sources:

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/186

### **Easter Island**

Site: Rapa Nui, Easter Island, Chile

Indicators: i, iii, v

Comments (how OU identified, impact assessments, data / evidence):

Inscribed 1995; site concentrates the legacy of the Rapa Nui culture in single sculptures (900-ish status, 300+ceremonial platforms, thousands of structures related to agriculture, production, funeral rites, housing etc built between 10<sup>th</sup> – 16<sup>th</sup> centuries); UNESCO WHS site appears to have nothing more recent than 1998, though a recent Courier (publication) includes an article on demise of the Rapa Nui / Polynesian language.

Airport opened in 1960s, and some would suggest tourism has reached unsustainable levels.

### Sources:

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/715

 $\underline{https://berkeleyplanningjournal.com/urbanfringe/2012/09/rapa-nui-on-the-verge-easter-islands-struggles-with-integration-and-globalization-in-the-information-age$ 

http://www.uixglobal.com/site/portfolio/03nrapa-nui-development-study/

https://www.islandstudies.ca/sites/islandstudies.ca/files/jurisdiction/Rapa%20Nui%20(Easter%20Island).pdf

### Gibraltar

Site: Gorham's Cave Complex, Gibraltar

Indicators: iii

Comments (	how OU identified	, impact assessments	. data	/ evidence	۱:

Inscribed 2016; Four caves with archaeological and paleontological evidence of Neanderthal occupation, over a period in excess of 100,000 years.

Very limited info, but hopefully we can ask. Direct contact not been made but could be reached out to through Mike Pienkowski

### Sources:

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1500

### Bermuda

Site: Historic Town of St George and related fortifications, Bermuda

Indicators: iv

Comments (how OU identified, impact assessments, data / evidence):

Inscribed 2000

Founded in 1612 St George is an outstanding example of a continuously occupied, fortified colonial town, and the earliest English settlement in the New World.

Limited info on site; doesn't appear to have had any major questions or updates.

90% Government, 8% in country donations, 2% Individual visitor charges Static, to minor increase Very positive: conservation; political support for conservation

Positive: Management effectiveness, recognition, legal/policy framework; lobbying,

institutional coordination

No impact: funding for property; research and montoriting, education

Sources:

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/983

•					
	n	n	To	~	S:
_	u	•	LO		.э.

### **Barbados**

Site: Historic Bridgetown and its Garrison

Indicators: ii, iii, iv

Comments (how OU identified, impact assessments, data / evidence):

Inscribed 2011

Bridgetown and its garrison are an outstanding example of British Colonial architecture of a well-preserved old town built in 17<sup>th</sup>, 18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> centuries. One of the earliest established fortified Caribbean towns, Bridgetown was the focus of trade-based English expansion into the Americas, and the garrison is an exceptional testimony of British defence in the Caribbean / Americas.

Problems apparently flagged by UNESCO (or another body?) and questions asked about the state of conservation in 2012 and 2014; detailed response to queries appears to be held on website.

### Sources:

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1376

2014: State of Conservation Report submitted by UNESCO requiring specific improvements, and response from State Party to UNESCO

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1376/documents

(nothing subsequently?)

### Malta

Site: Knight Fortification

Date of Submission: 1998

Criteria: (i)(ii)(iv)

Geographic location has an emphatic habit of influencing the course of history. The story of Malta is an important case in point. Sited practically in the centre of the Mediterranean, its important strategic position was such that none of the maritime powers then vying for the control of this sea could have afforded to ignore it. The island's position was ideal, for apart from commanding the narrow waters between the two great basins of the Mediterranean, it also possessed excellent natural harbours, secure havens for battle fleets. It was, above all, the presence of the Grand Harbour that was to prove so instrumental in attracting foreign occupation. And once occupied, the need to secure this anchorage from attack was to dictate the scope and form of the island's defenses. Thus, over the centuries, the harbour area has witnessed the building of great works of fortification designed by engineers from

most of the major military power: Spanish, Italian, French and British, the result of which is one of the finest collections of military architecture in the world

Sources: https://whc.unesco.org/en/tentativelists/982/

Adrian Mallia, Adi Associates was involved in the preparation of the 1998 Tentative List bid

### Antigua

Site: Antigua Naval Dockyard

Indicators: ii, iv

Comments (how OU identified, impact assessments, data / evidence):

Inscribed in 2016; no updates yet.

The Antigua Naval Dockyard and its related Archaeological sites demonstrate how British Admiralty building prototypes were adapted to cope with extremes in climate; few other sites demonstrate this transition of British prototypes to the use of colonial building forms as well as Antigua Naval Dockyard. The site demonstrates the process of colonisation as well as the global spread of ideas, technologies and building forms; the Dockyard also shows the exploitation of available geo-morphological features within the construction of a strategic structure.

#### Sources:

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1499 https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1499

### **Mauritius**

Site: Aapravasi Ghat, Port Louis, Mauritius

Indicators: vi

Comments (how OU identified, impact assessments, data / evidence):

Inscribed 2006

The remains of an immigration depot, Aapravasi Ghat is the site the British government selected in 1834 for the 'great experiment' of using indentured labour rather than slaves. Over half a million Indian people passed through the building between 1834 and 1920.

Regular State of Conservation Reports in documents section of UNESCO website; 2019 report by State Party notes the UNESCO 2018 recommendations and gives their feedback (essentially they have agreed to create a Master Plan for the site, including the buffer zone). It appears that there has been development within the buffer zone, and the regular reports may be in response to those issues. However, property is not currently on 'danger' list.

### Sources:

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1227

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1227/documents/

Others: Cidade Velha, Historic Centre of Ribeira Grande citeria: (ii)(iii)(vi) 2009, no reporting documentation so not able to comment on progress since inscription.

The town of Ribeira Grande, renamed Cidade Velha in the late 18th century, was the first European colonial outpost in the tropics. Located in the south of the island of Santiago, the town features some of the original street layout impressive remains including two churches, a royal fortress and Pillory Square with its ornate 16th century marble pillar.

Brimstone Hill Fortress National Park Brimstone Hill Fortress National Park Criteria: (iii)(iv) 1999 is an outstanding, well-preserved example of 17th- and 18th-century military architecture in a Caribbean context. Designed by the British and built by African slave labour, the fortress is testimony to European colonial expansion, the African slave trade and the emergence of new societies in the Caribbean.

### Wales (Tentative)

**Site:** Slate Industry of North Wales, Gwynedd, Wales

Indicators: ii, v

Comments (how OU identified, impact assessments, data / evidence):

Tentative List since 2012

Exhibits an important exchange of human values, in terms of extractive technology, building materials, transport technology and emigration.

Outstanding example of the transformation of a traditional human settlement and land use into modern industry, without losing its distinctive character and language.

(included because of 2015 study of anticipated economic benefits)

#### **Sources:**

https://whc.unesco.org/en/tentativelists/5678/

http://www.llechi.cymru/SiteElements/Dogfennau/GwyneddHeritageReport/PN03414OGwyneddHeritageFinalReportv8ExecutiveSummaryEnglish.pdf (2015)

#### **Mixed sites**

**United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Island** 

Site: St Kilda

Indicators: iii; v; vii; ix; x; 1986, 2004, 2005

Comments (how OU identified, impact assessments, data / evidence:

It is a volcanic archipelago, situated off the west coast of mainland Scotland and comprises the islands of Hirta, Dun, Soay and Boreray. Has large colonies of rare and endangered species of birds, especially puffins, fulmars and gannets. Inscribed 1986 with extensions in 2004 and 2005. The natural and cultural attributes are threatened to a degree by a range of remote and local environment and anthropogenic factors ie climate change and unsustainable tourism. Climate conditions and coastal erosion remain the main threat to the abandoned house, cleits and other archaeological remains. Accidental introduction of invasive species poses a significant threat to the natural heritage and potential threat to the integrity of the marine environment from variations in the marine ecosystem. The challenge of for conservation of the cultural landscape is to keep a balance between intervention and active conservation work to minimise decay.

Government 17%; In country donation 2.5%; Individual visitor charges 0.5%, commercial operator payments 80% Variable Minor increase Positive: Recognition, education, political support for conservation, lobbying

No impact: conservation, research and monitoring, management effectiveness, funding for property, institutional coordination

#### Sources:

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/387

https://www.kilda.org.uk/frame26.htm

https://www.historicenvironment.scot/advice-and-support/listing-scheduling-and-designations/world-heritage-sites/st-kilda/

#### Jamaica

Site: Blue and John Crow Mountains

Indicators: iii; vi; x

Sources:

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1356

https://www.visitjamaica.com/listing/blue-and-john-crow-mountains-national-park/256/

https://www.britannica.com/place/Blue-and-John-Crow-Mountains-National-Park

## **United Kingdom**

Site: Lake District

**Indicators:** Cultural Landscape

2017

https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/422

# Seychelles -Tentative

Site: Silhouette Island

**Indicators:** (v) (x)

Comments (how OU identified, impact assessments, data / evidence:

2013

Silhouette was the first island of the group to be seen when the islands were discovered in 1609 but was not settled until the early 19th century.

From 1860 attempts were made to develop parts of the island for agriculture or forestry. A wide range of plants was introduced for crops of timber, fruit, spices and oils. These are all abandoned now but the plants can still be found growing in the most unlikely places. In the 1940s a small grove of Coco-de-Mer trees (*Lodoicea maldivica*) was planted high in the mountains. This thriving population of this rare palm provided an occupation for part of the 1000 strong labour force on the island, some of whom had to climb up to the trees to water them daily. The dramatic legacy of the island's history; a cast-iron neo-classical mausoleum, is the most remarkable piece of eccentricity in all Seychelles.

**Sources:** https://whc.unesco.org/en/tentativelists/5799/